

Durham County Council

DLO Health-check

Sept 2013

Prepared For:



Durham County Council
County Hall
Durham
DH1 5UL

Prepared By:



Savills (UK) Limited
33 Margaret Street
London W1G 0JD

**DURHAM COUNTY COUNCIL
DLO HEALTHCHECK
CONTENTS**

CONTENTS

1.0	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
2.0	INTRODUCTION	2
3.0	PRIVATE SECTOR V DLO	3
4.0	CLIENT FUNCTION	6
5.0	BENCHMARKING.....	7
6.0	DLO MANAGEMENT APPROACH	9
7.0	DLO BUSINESS SYSTEMS	11
8.0	SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION.....	15

APPENDICES

Appendix 1 – Benchmarking

DURHAM COUNTY COUNCIL DLO HEALTHCHECK

1.0 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1.1 Savills have been commissioned by Durham County Council to undertake a review of its Housing Repairs and Maintenance DLO, which is part of the Council's Direct Works. This review is linked to the potential transfer of the Council's housing stock to a new housing group.

1.2 The purpose of this review is to determine whether the DLO is fit for purpose to transfer to the new housing group, whether it represents a significant degree of risk to the new organisation, as a result of the quality of service provided, or the cost of the service.

1.3 Based on our review we believe the DLO offers value for money, has the potential to deliver further improvements, and has the management ethos, and systems that make it suitable to transfer to the new organisation. On the proviso that it continues its current direction of travel.

It is important that the DLO continue to undertake a mix of work including responsive repairs, voids and capital works to ensure it is viable in the longer term.

1.4 We would suggest that the DLO focuses on the continued development of its capacity to grow and provide further services in the longer term, and if resources permit is allowed to retain part of the surplus it delivers, to make the investment required to achieve this objective.

1.5 The future structure and procurement strategy of the new group should consider the; location of the DLO within the group i.e. providing services to one member of the group or in the longer term to all members of the group, the impact of any structure on client services, and the current contractual arrangements for repairs and maintenance in Dale and Valley and East Durham Homes.

In our view there are potential value for money and VAT advantages if the DLO provides, in the medium term repairs and maintenance services to the whole of the group.

2.0 INTRODUCTION

2.1 Durham County Council's housing stock is currently managed by three organisations, Durham City Homes directly manages the stock in the city of Durham area, and two ALMOs Dale and Valley Homes in the West and East Durham Homes in the East currently manage the housing stock on the Council's behalf.

Durham County Council is considering the potential transfer of its housing stock to a new housing group (which will be a Registered Provider) which will maintain the identity of the current organisations, or the formation of a single ALMO.

If the Council is content, following discussions with the government, to adopt the transfer option, and subject to successful ballot of the tenants, the housing stock will transfer in the early part of 2015.

2.2 The Housing Repairs and Maintenance DLO (DLO) is a section within Durham County Council's Direct Works. It currently undertakes reactive repairs, voids, gas servicing, and capital works including heating installations, and internal improvements (kitchens, bathrooms, re-wiring) on behalf of Durham City Homes. The DLO also undertakes gas servicing on behalf of Dale and Valley Homes.

Dale and Valley and East Durham Homes have commissioned external private sector Contractors to provide their other repairs and maintenance requirements. These contracts are out-with the scope of this review, we understand these are due to expire in 2017-18.

2.3 In light of the potential transfer Durham County Council has commissioned Savills to undertake a health check review of the DLO. The health check is designed to assist the Council and the new housing group in determining whether the DLO should transfer, having considered the current performance and efficiency, and to determine any actions or improvements required.

The health check will allow the new organisation to assess the risk, if any, of the DLO transferring to the new group. It is also normally required by the Homes and Community Agency (HCA) as part of the approval of registration of the new housing group as a Registered Provider (RP).

2.4 As part of our review we have considered the following :-

- The structure and trade base of the DLO.
- The approach to management and leadership.
- The mix of work being undertaken i.e. reactive, void and capital.
- The performance management system.
- Benchmarking of value for money including customer satisfaction, key performance indicators, and cost.
- A on-site sample inspection of the work undertaken by the DLO including capital works, reactive, and voids.
- The support services provided to the DLO by the Council's Contact Centre, Fleet and Stores.
- The overall direction of travel, and whether the DLO is fit for purpose, and capable of transferring to a new housing organisation without representing a significant degree of risk.
- Any suggested improvements required to maximise the potential of the DLO.
- An indication of the potential impact of the transfer of the DLO to a new organisation on the Council.

2.5 Durham City Homes in 2010 commissioned HQN a consultancy firm, to undertake a value for money review of its repairs and maintenance service.¹ In summary at this time HQN concluded the following:-

- The DLO has most of the characteristics of high performing maintenance service.
- That Durham City Homes would not secure any meaningful benefit or support from market testing the DLO .
- That any weaknesses that were identified could be addressed by the development of an Action Plan.
- The Action Plan included in the report :-
 - Improved information for customers on the status of their repair including follow on works.
 - Improvements leading to a greater degree of right first time.
 - Use of customer feedback to improve the delivery of the service.
 - Ensure reports are used to monitor and manage productivity.
 - Reduce the number repairs ordered in emergency and urgent categories.
 - Review how support services are delivered i.e. contact centre, stores etc.

2.6 The DLO operates as a division within Durham County Council as such it does not have a separate specific Business Plan. At present, working within the Durham County Council environment the projected income for Repairs and Maintenance for the next three years is £4M per annum. Subject to the DLO being able to offer competitive prices the DLO will undertake 25% of the Durham City Homes capital programme.

3.0 PRIVATE SECTOR V DLO

3.1 In-house Repairs and Maintenance Contractors like the DLO, on the assumption that they are efficient can offer add value to the new housing group in the following ways:

- Improved customer satisfaction;
- A more cohesive approach to preventative maintenance based on the DLOs' detailed knowledge of the housing's stock; and
- Subject to continuity of work and the DLO being allowed to undertake the correct mix of work (i.e. voids, reactive and planned/capital works) - social dividends including long term employment, training, local employment and opportunities for supply chain partners.

Should the transfer proceed the DLO offers the potential for VAT savings on labour for repairs and maintenance work i.e. reactive repairs and voids.

Capital works are normally covered by a VAT exemption agreement (shelter) during the first 5-10 years post transfer. There is therefore no VAT savings for the DLO carrying out these works during this initial 5-10 year period, a saving can however realised thereafter.

3.2 Achieving these benefits will mean that the DLO's operational methodology, structure and cost base will differ from the private sector. DLO staff will enjoy more job security, increased sick pay, and pensions provision.

A private sector Contractor has the ability to spread its overhead over a number of contracts, the DLO does not have this advantage and can effect only charge their overhead to a single client. In the longer term activity will require to grow to maximise the benefit of these overheads.

An organisation like DLO is focused on long-term employment which has a wider social benefit and is not a 'hire and fire' organisation. As a result they need to undertake activity that provides continuity of work for their workforce and actively plan their long term, work mix (i.e. capital, responsive, and void), resource levels and trade mix.

In simple terms DLO hourly productive rate will be significantly above the private sector, in effect they need to work harder than the private sector to make up this difference, for example we would generally expect a private sector Contractor to operate at £28-32/productive hour and a DLO to operate between £35-42/productive hour.

In relation to its work mix, to be a viable longer term business, the DLO needs to undertake, responsive, voids and planned works. Table 1 summaries the benefits and challenges of a DLO.

Table 1

BENEFITS- ADDED VALUE	CHALLENGES
Improved Customer Satisfaction	Higher Cost Base Than Private Sector – Due to Different Objectives
Long Term Employment and Training	Continuity of Work Required to Ensure - Longer Term Employment
Opportunities for SME and Suppliers	Need to Work Harder to Match the Private Sector
Cohesive Approach to Preventative Maintenance	Mix of work i.e. voids, reactive, and capital to allow the DLO to be value for money
Potential VAT savings for repairs and maintenance	Forward planning of resources and flexibility e.g. short term contracts to ensure DLO size matches the organisation's needs

The objective is to create DLO as a business that is efficient, has the business intelligence and understanding to maintain its efficiency, and is the right size to suit Durham City Homes current needs or the future potential needs of the new housing organisation.

- 3.5 The DLO is part of the wide range of services Durham County Council operates. Given the breadth and depth of users of the service it can take time and continual effort to develop and define a clear service offering for each user. A well managed efficient housing repairs and maintenance business is seeking to respond to customer's demands, which will vary daily and weekly, and has less opportunity than other users to plan a significant quantity of its work.

The DLO will use a high volume of standard materials components, and will need to have reliable fleet provision, and a high quality of call handling to achieve maximum efficiency and ensure customers, as much as possible receive a right first time service. Over time it would clearly be an advantage where possible for the support services provided by Durham County Council to evolve and provide further support to the DLO.

4.0 CLIENT FUNCTION

- 4.1 At present for Repairs and Maintenance the DLO provides both Client and Contractor functions. This includes providing specialist technical advice for gas and electrical services, (including ensuring that Durham City Homes complies fully with its landlord obligations), the specification of all electrical and gas installations, quality control etc. The DLO obtains a fee of £300K per year for providing client services.

In relation to the capital works undertaken by the DLO, Durham City Homes undertakes the Client role.

When the structure of the new housing group is developed it will need to consider the location of the DLO within the group, i.e. whether it remains with Durham City Homes, or becomes a group service provider capable of providing services to the whole of the group (e.g. the DLO currently undertakes gas servicing for Dale and Valley Homes), and to organisations beyond the group in the longer term.

Part of this discussion will need to consider how the Client function for Repairs and Maintenance is undertaken and whether it remains with the DLO or is separated out.

- 4.2 There is a danger that a commercially focused DLO acting as Client and Contractor will seek to maximise the amount of income they obtain for the activity they undertake, and as a result exceed the budgets available to the organisation they provide services to.

On basis of our review we can confirm there is a clear understanding within the DLO of the need as the Client to operate within the repairs and maintenance budgets that are available from Durham City Homes. There is also a clear focus both from the DLO and Durham City Homes via the performance management framework that is in place, and via a structured series of meetings focused on monitoring and improving the quality of service provided to customers.

- 4.3 Information available, from the repairs service is an important asset management tool. Repairs 'hot spot' or trend analysis can identify the early failure of components, properties with maintenance demand, and guide the development of capital investment, planned and cyclical maintenance programmes. Thereby reducing long term maintenance expenditure.

We note the approach being adopted by the DLO and Durham City Homes in re-roofing dormers where there has been a recent history of high responsive repair. This is an example of the approach we would expect the DLO to build on, by advising where high levels of maintenance are being incurred, where components e.g. type of boilers are consistently failing, and proposing a resolution either via capital investment or a planned maintenance works.

4.4 Where a DLO undertakes capital works it requires an informed client working in partnership to be successful especially in the current economic climate, where tender prices have reduced significantly over the last 18-24 months. Perhaps not surprisingly there has been a more commercial claims based approach from the private sector. It is therefore more important to consider not only the tender price but the likely out-turn cost (including variations) when the work is completed.

It is important that the client is aware of the differences between the DLO and the private sector, in particular the differences in operating models, cost base, and resource planning. Perhaps more than any other relationship in housing investment a genuine partnership approach is required between the DLO and the client team in Durham City Homes, We would expect the following to be undertaken in this regard :-

- Planning of the programme to allow the DLO to plan the use of its resources effectively.
- Review of the pricing levels from the DLO and an understanding of sustainability of current prices from private sector Contractors.
- Agreed approach to scoping the works, carrying out pre-start measurement surveys, customer liaison to identify potential issues in advance of works commencing in a property.

Based on our review we are satisfied that a partnership does exist between the DLO and Durham City Homes. We also note that the Durham City Homes and the DLO benchmark the costs for capital works against the rates received from its private sector Contractors via the North East Procurement Consortium (NEP). Durham City Homes takes an informed view of the sustainability of some of the prices it receives from the private sector Contractors, and the DLO matches the price of the private sector Contractors on this basis.

4.5 The previous capital investment programme carried out by Durham City Homes, not untypically of many investment programmes at this time, was focused on achieving Decency, rather than the replacement of all the internal elements of a property at the same time. As a result when properties become void there will potentially be a higher degree of capital component replacement.

5.0 BENCHMARKING

5.1 Value for money covers a number of elements, customer satisfaction, the quality of the service provided (measured via Key Performance Indicators), the average of repairs and voids undertaken, and the operational cost of the DLO as the Contractor.

Establishing a direct comparator for DLO is difficult given the variable cost drivers that influence value for money. These include:

-
- Service standards including voids;
 - Geography and condition of stock;
 - The range of work (work mix) undertaken by the DLO. For example a Contractor undertaking capital work would be expected to be more productive than one undertaking responsive repairs; and
 - The efficiency of the DLO.

We have benchmarked the DLO based upon our own benchmarking data, and our assessment of the value for money that should in our view be delivered by an efficient Contractor utilising mobile working.

5.2 The DLO in 2012-13 incurred the following re-charges for central services provided by the Council

- Fleet Management £175,359
- Service Related Recharges £170,750
- Central Support £211,264

This represents a value equal 8% of turnover and is above the 3-5% level that would be expected in the private sector at present based on the tender returns we have received.

In addition the DLO delivered a surplus or contribution of £396,000 in 2012-13.

We would expect where a DLO operated within a new Registered Provider housing organisation that it would be allowed to retain part of the surplus generated to re-invest either in new IT, equipment, new staff with a specialist skills etc.

5.3 Durham City Homes has recently undertaken a customer satisfaction return this indicated a relatively high level of 84% with the repairs and maintenance service, with a high degree of satisfaction with the attitude of the trades staff.

5.4 The key findings of this benchmarking exercise based on the information provided by DLO are as follows:-

- A continuous improvement trend is clearly identified.
- The quality of the service is high based on the information provided.
- Productivity levels for DLO are at the mid-point of the range we would expect in part of the level of turnover per operative level generated reflects the level of overhead and re-charge being incurred.

-
- Further productivity and cost benefits in the longer term will be linked to materials purchases, and potentially reductions to fuel usage.
 - Generally repairs costs are well within the benchmark costs.
 - Voids costs are increasing, we note that 30-40% of the voids undertaken involving capital components which is above the level we would expect and will tend to a degree to skew the costs.
 - Sub-contracting costs are not significant in relation to this DLO.

We would suggest that the DLO at this time offers value for money and has the potential to offer further improvements in this regard.

- 5.5 We recognise the higher than usual level of capital works within the voids being undertaken by the DLO.

Increasing void costs, and increased levels of void activity due to housing benefit changes, are a common theme based on our experiences across the county, these will remain higher than normal in at least the short term. Ensuring properties are re-let as quickly as possible is clearly important.

In these circumstances having a further review of the volume and type of voids, scope and standards, and resourcing, to ensure that there are no further alterations or improvements required, would in our view be prudent.

6.0 DLO MANAGEMENT APPROACH

- 6.1 Leadership and the approach to overall management approach are key elements of a successful DLO. In this regard we are looking for the following :-

- Clear vision and direction.
- Focused management meeting structure including the following regular meetings
 - Client and Contractor meeting
 - DLO Senior Management Team meetings
 - Team meetings for each section - voids, responsive etc
- The management meetings should be supported by regular performance management reports on quality, productivity, finance etc.
- Regular briefings to the work-force on the support required from them to ensure the business is viable in the longer term.

-
- A clear view of resource requirements, the maximisation of use of the core permanent work-force and the flexible use of short term contracts, and sub-contractors to support peaks of activity.
 - The development of a long term plan for the development and potential growth of the service.

6.2 In our view the DLO has a clear focus in its management team and within its work-force on ensuring that it provides a quality service to customers, and maximises the use of its in-house resources. Short term contracts, agency staff and sub-contractors are only being used to supplement peaks in activity e.g. the growth in the capital works in 2013-14, and in areas such as voids which may be under-going a short term spike in activity due to the recent welfare reforms.

6.3 The current work-force contains a core trade number of 44 trades supported by 30 agency staff (a process of recruiting staff on short term contracts is on-going), the work-force and structure has the flexibility to deal within a reduction in capital works without affecting the core work-force levels.

The work-force levels are planned and managed. The partnership approach by the Durham City Homes assists and supports this approach.

6.4 The DLO has a clear meeting structure focused on the effective management of the service of the type we would expect, this is supported by effective performance management systems, further details of the systems used are included in section 7.0 below.

The current management team has a clear ethos and desire to deliver. There are a number of areas where some elements of work are deferred to one individual e.g. work at height, using the Northgate system and HR issues, it would be preferable to ensure all managers have the skills and experience to take on work of this type. We note a proposed new structure has been developed by the DLO to develop further longer term capacity.

6.5 As part of review we carried out a series of briefings with the trades staff of the DLO. As part of these briefings we sought some indicative views on from the trades staff of the current position of the DLO and its future. These indicated a dedicated, informed work-force, with a desire to expand, and take on new activities. It was also clear that the work-force saw the potential transfer as a clear benefit to their long term future.

7.0 DLO BUSINESS SYSTEMS

7.1 It is an essential requirement in achieving value for money that a business like the DLO that it has an effective Performance Management suite of information focusing on the following key elements:

- Productivity;
- Non Productivity i.e. sickness, training, leave etc;
- Income i.e. Schedule of Rates earnings;
- Job costing;
- Sub-contracting use;
- Quality performance including customer satisfaction and Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) measuring performance on appointments made and kept, right first time, and repairs completed within the time bands set by the Repairs Policy;
- Fleet vehicle usage and performance; and
- Trading account accurately reflecting income against cost per cost centre e.g. reactive repairs, voids and planned works.

For an organisation like the DLO to fully realise its potential these systems should be in place, and their benefits realised, and commercial understanding developed throughout the management team of the organisation.

7.2 The DLO utilises Northgate to provide performance information and to run exception reports e.g. to determine if a target wasn't achieved or repair wasn't complete why this occurred. There is also a focus on ensuring all repairs are tracked and accounted for i.e. are they complete, overdue, non access or cancelled.

There is a particular focus on ensuring follow on repairs i.e. additional work, the ordering of new components, work requiring scaffolding are recorded, the customer kept informed and that the work is carried out. Failing to carry out follow on works is one of the main reasons for customer dissatisfaction in our experience

The systems being used are in line with our expectations and add validity to the performance being reported.

7.3 Productivity management is at the heart of managing a DLO. The DLO has a clear focus on productivity management including the following :-

- Timesheets are completed daily by operatives and reviewed on a regular basis by managers.
- For responsive repairs the planning system is monitored by both the planning staff and managers to ensure trade staff are fully employed.
- Trades staff are encouraged to phone in if they have completed their work early or they require further work.
- Productivity reports are run weekly and monthly to establish if the operative productivity is being maximised, these are reported both to the management team and to the operatives via team meetings.
- For capital works a defined programme of works is established and the installation team are given a clear time period to complete certain tasks.
- Processes are reviewed to drive further improvements e.g. changing the mix of electrical re-wire squads to one electrical and two electrical mates, power flushing heating systems the same day they are installed, and using driver/labourers to strip out kitchens.
- Of the core work-force 20 operatives are currently multi-skilled and the DLO is seeking further volunteers this year.

The DLO is about to introduce the measurement of actual against planned time for voids.

7.4 The SOR used by the DLO is a non standard one e.g. the National Federation of Housing Associations Schedule of Rates (NatFed SOR). The Schedule of Rates (SOR) system used by the DLO in effect, groups similar types of responsive repairs with a similar range of cost or timescale to establish a commitment value and a timescale for an appointment.

Voids are scheduled and a time scale determined for the completion of the work, and materials ordered based upon the schedule. Once the repair or void is completed the DLO recovers actual cost i.e. labour cost plus materials allocation. The SOR is not used to charge for work completed, which is not a significant issue in the current operational environment. If the DLO was working for external clients then it would need to measure the SOR or income value against the actual cost.

The labour rate of £44/ per hour used is set to recover the cost of the DLO undertaking repairs and maintenance costs including overheads and re-charges for central Council services. Where the DLO over-recovers this cost due to the level of work undertaken a rebate is provided to the client.

For the capital works the DLO charges an agreed cost, which has been matched against the private sector Contractors. Payment is only made when the work is complete and handed over.

-
- 7.5 A trading account is prepared by the County Council finance team. The accountant involved provides a wide range of services to number of different sections in the Council. The trading account attributes income based on the actual cost of repairs and voids completed, and the agreed cost of capital works completed an income value and establishes a cost for the operation of the DLO.

The DLO received a fee of £300K for providing client service and was charged £556K in 2012-13 for the Councils central services including HR, Finance and a re-charge for stores, the Contact Centre and Fleet services. The DLO seeks to deliver a surplus of 4-5% of turnover.

The current trading account is sufficient for the current operation, in the longer term the DLO will require a trading account that is broken down into cost centres e.g. voids, capital and by contract to ensure that it remains clear sighted on the performance of each part of its business.

- 7.6 Linked to the potential transfer, a longer term IT strategy is being developed for the new organisation this will consider the overall, finance, housing management, repairs client and a consequence the Contracting system used by the DLO in the long term.

There is a clear rigour and focus within the DLO on, tracking, closing off and completing jobs, ensuring records, including timesheets, certification, materials purchases, are up to date and current. Some of the processes used, due to the current IT systems, are manual and involve double data entry. For example there are some stand alone systems in use including the gas servicing database which does not a present directly link to the PIMSS asset management system used by Durham City Homes.

What works now will not work in the future. For the DLO to expand it will require to take on additional work without significantly increasing its overheads. it will require to invest in new systems e.g. electronic certification for gas and electrical installations. The IT system and new structure are therefore important factors in the longer term development of the DLO.

- 7.7 Utilising sub-contractors to provide specialist services e.g. drain clearance, asbestos removal, rot works, or to provide additional resources to support peak activity is an essential part of operating a DLO. The over reliance of sub-contractors where there is weak or ineffective management of the core work-force incurs additional and unnecessary cost.

In our view the DLO's use of sub-contractors linked to its productivity management systems is appropriate to its current operations

7.8 Call handling is currently provided by the Council's Contact Centre, a Service Level Agreement is in place covering this service. Call handling especially the correct categorisation of the repair, and the correct diagnosis is a crucial element of effective customer service, and the efficient delivery by the DLO, its importance can't be underestimated especially given it cost over £40 hour per trades person for the DLO to provide its services.

Ideally the call handlers should be skilled and focused solely focused on repairs calls (given the specific technical nature of this role), and located next to the planners to allow them to act in an integrated manner. We note that call handlers are being based placed in the DLO office to allow them to understand the function and skills required. We would suggest that this approach is extended and made permanent.

7.9 Materials purchases are controlled via the admin team of the DLO utilising the Council's purchasing system Oracle. The DLO purchases materials the majority of materials via the Council's stores and via NEP, and major materials suppliers.

The Council stores serves a wide range of users including roads, public buildings and the DLO, it also provides a waste transfer facility. Improvements in the service have been made via the introduction of void packs which are assembled and delivered to site by the stores. There is however a mismatch between the service required by the DLO, which is a fast paced housing repairs business and that currently provided by the stores servicing a wide range of customers.

We have not undertaken a stores review as part of our report we would suggest however that in partnership with the DLO and stores the following areas are reviewed :-

- The location and organisation of the shelving.
- Ensuing all material deliveries are placed on the shelves as soon as possible.
- Maintaining a current and accurate understanding of the level of stock in the stores.
- Ensuring all stock re-ordering levels are correct and reflect usage.
- Van stocking of DLO vans by the stores.

It would also worth reviewing parking arrangements adjacent to the stores, and looking at the improving the manual stores issuing system to ensure that stock levels are current(real-time) and accurate.

Improvements in this area will allow enhance the service offered by the stores, make the service more attractive to the DLO and reduce the time spent by the DLO sourcing materials.

7.10 Van tracking systems where a DLO has an effective productivity management system and a committed work force provide the following additional benefits in our view :-

- Lone worker safety.
- Driver education.
- Vehicle usage to assist with ensuring the fleet matches the requirement of the work being undertaken.
- Reviewing routing of vehicles to ensure that mileage where possible is reduced.
- The potential to reduce fleet maintenance costs and fuel usage.

The benefits will be available in the future if and when trackers are reduced. We would suggest that the DLO continues to work with the Council's fleet team to see if further improvements in the service being provided are possible e.g. out of hours servicing and the potential availability of alternative vehicles when vehicles are being serviced.

8.0 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

8.1 The DLO has demonstrated a positive direction of travel and based on the information provided is delivering value for money, within its current operating environment.

8.2 The DLO in our view has the management ethos, drive and systems that will ensure it is fit for purpose and capable of transferring to the new organisation, on the proviso that it continues the progress that has been made.

8.3 There is a high degree of rigour in the DLO in maintaining and keeping current its core business management information e.g. repairs completion, gas certificates etc. Some of this involves manual processes due to current systems. Investment will be required to allow the DLO in future to take on additional work without significantly increasing its overheads.

8.4 We would suggest that the DLO continues to work in partnership with other parts of the Council to assist them to understand its specific needs as housing repairs and maintenance business and to seek to identify further beneficial changes in the services they provide to the DLO.

8.5 We would recommend that the DLO transfers to the new housing organisation. It would be appropriate to consider the location of the DLO within the new group i.e. does it provide service to one organisation or all of the organisations in the group over the longer term, thereby potentially offering savings in VAT for the provision of repairs and maintenance services.

APPENDIX 1 BENCHMARKING

Table 1 – Quality Indicators

Repair Category	Savills Benchmark	2010-2011	2011-2012	2012-13	Comment
% of emergencies repairs completed on time	96-99	96.5	99	99.5	
% of routine repairs completed on time	96-99	-	-	-	Not measured
% of urgent repairs completed on time	96-99	98	99	99	
Average number of days taken to complete urgent jobs	3-5	-	-	-	Not Measured
Average number of days taken to complete routine	12-18	9.5	10	8.8	
% of repair appointments kept	97-99%	-	98.6	99.1	

Table 2 – Cost Indicators

Key Indicator	Savills Benchmark	2010-2011	2011-2012	2012-13	
Cost per void	£802-1544	2612	2555	2802	Assumes 10% Capital Works
Cost Per Emergency Repair	£47-63	31	31	30	
Cost Per Urgent Repair	£56-68	32	32	36	
Cost Per Non Urgent/Routine	£89-107	54	61	62	
Cost Per Planned	£110-225	-	-	89	

Table 3 – DLO Operational Indicators

Key Indicator	Savills Benchmark	2010-2011	2011-2012	2012-13	Comment
Turnover	Total Income (inc VAT)	£5,590,149	£6,108,539	£7,159,164	Includes Dale and Valley
	Overheads	£2,590,476	£1,226,264	£1,191,188	
	Net	£2,999,673	£4,882,275	£5,967,976	
	Core	48	48	48	
	Agency	4	21	26	
Turnover per operative (net of sub-contractors and overhead)	£75-£85K	£57,596	£70,300	£80,312	
Supervisor to Trades Staff Ratio	1:8 to 1:15	7	10	11	
% Surplus	4-6%	-4%	4%	5%	